## GCE Examinations

## Advanced Subsidiary / Advanced Level

## Decision Mathematics

Module D2

Paper A

## MARKING GUIDE


#### Abstract

This guide is intended to be as helpful as possible to teachers by providing concise solutions and indicating how marks should be awarded. There are obviously alternative methods that would also gain full marks.


Method marks (M) are awarded for knowing and using a method.
Accuracy marks (A) can only be awarded when a correct method has been used.
(B) marks are independent of method marks.

Written by Craig Hunter, Edited by Shaun Armstrong
© Solomon Press
1.

|  |  | B |  |  | row minimum |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | I | II | III |  |
| A | I | - 3 | 4 | 0 | -3 |
|  | II | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 |
|  | III | 3 | -2 | ${ }^{-} 1$ | - 2 |
| column maximum |  | 3 | 4 | 1 |  |

M1 A1
$\max ($ row $\min )=\min (\operatorname{col} \max )=1 \therefore$ saddle point
M1
$\therefore A$ should play II all the time, $B$ should play III all the time
M1 A1
2. (a) $x_{11}$ - number of crates from $A$ to $D$
$x_{12}$ - number of crates from $A$ to $E$
$x_{13}$ - number of crates from $A$ to $F$
$x_{21}$ - number of crates from $B$ to $D$
$x_{22}$ - number of crates from $B$ to $E$
$x_{23}$ - number of crates from $B$ to $F$
$x_{31}$ - number of crates from $C$ to $D$
B1
$x_{32}$ - number of crates from $C$ to $E$
$x_{33}$ - number of crates from $C$ to $F$
(b) minimise

$$
z=19 x_{11}+22 x_{12}+13 x_{13}+18 x_{21}+14 x_{22}+26 x_{23}+27 x_{31}+16 x_{32}+19 x_{33} \quad \text { B2 }
$$

(c) $x_{11}+x_{12}+x_{13}=42$ number of crates at $A$
$x_{21}+x_{22}+x_{23}=26$ number of crates at $B$
$x_{31}+x_{32}+x_{33}=32$ number of crates at $C$
$x_{11}+x_{21}+x_{31}=29 \quad$ number of crates required by $D$
$x_{12}+x_{22}+x_{32}=47$ number of crates required by $E$ M1 A1
$x_{13}+x_{23}+x_{33}=24 \quad$ number of crates required by $F$
$x_{i j} \geq 0$ for all $i, j$
reference to balance B1
3.

| Stage | State | Destination | Cost | Total cost |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Marquee | Deluxe | 20 | $20^{*}$ |
|  |  | Cuisine | 24 | 24 |
|  | Castle | Deluxe | 21 | 21 |
|  |  | Castle | 15 | $15^{*}$ |
|  |  | Cuisine | 22 | 22 |
|  | Hotel | Deluxe | 18 | $18^{*}$ |
|  |  | Cuisine | 23 | 23 |
|  |  | Hotel | 19 | 19 |
| 2 |  | Marquee | 2 | $2+20=22$ |
|  |  | Castle | 5.5 | $5.5+15=20.5^{*}$ |
|  |  | Hotel | 3 | $3+18=21$ |
|  | Castle | Marquee | 3 | $3+20=23$ |
|  | Castle | 5 | $5+15=20^{*}$ |  |
|  | Registry | Marquee | 3.5 | $3.5+20=23.5$ |
|  | Office | Castle | 6 | $6+15=21$ |
|  | Hotel | 2 | $2+18=20^{*}$ |  |
| 3 | Home | Castle | 3 | $3+20.5=23.5$ |
|  |  | Church | 5 | $5+20=25$ |
|  |  | Registry | 1 | $1+20=21^{*}$ |

M1 A1

M1 A2

A1
minimum cost with ceremony - Registry Office reception - Hotel catering - Deluxe
cost $=£ 2100$
A1
(9)
4. (i)

| order: | 1 | 4 | 8 | 2 | 3 | 6 | 5 | 7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $A$ | $B$ | $C$ | $D$ | $E$ | $F$ | $G$ | $H$ |
| $A$ | - | 85 | 59 | 31 | 47 | 52 | 74 | 41 |
| $B$ | 85 | - | 104 | 73 | 51 | 68 | 43 | 55 |
| $C$ | 59 | 104 | - | 54 | 62 | 88 | 61 | 45 |
| $D$ | 31 | 73 | 54 | - | 40 | 59 | 65 | 78 |
| $E$ | 47 | 51 | 62 | 40 | - | 56 | 71 | 68 |
| $F$ | 52 | 68 | 88 | 59 | 56 | - | 53 | 49 |
| $G$ | 74 | 43 | 61 | 65 | 71 | 53 | - | 63 |
| $H$ | 41 | 55 | 45 | 78 | 68 | 49 | 63 | - |

tour: $A D E B G F H C A$
upper bound $=31+40+51+43+53+49+45+59=371 \mathrm{~km}$
(ii) e.g. beginning at $A$

| order: | 1 | 4 | 7 | 2 | 3 | 6 | 5 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $A$ | $B$ | $C$ | $D$ | $E$ | $F$ | $G$ | $H$ |
| $A$ | - | 85 | 59 | 31 | 47 | 52 | 74 | 41 |
| $B$ | 85 | - | 104 | 73 | 51 | 68 | 43 | 55 |
| $C$ | 59 | 104 | - | 54 | 62 | 88 | 61 | 45 |
| $D$ | 31 | 73 | 54 | - | 40 | 59 | 65 | 78 |
| $E$ | 47 | 51 | 62 | 40 | - | 56 | 71 | 68 |
| $F$ | 52 | 68 | 88 | 59 | 56 | - | 53 | 49 |
| $G$ | 74 | 43 | 61 | 65 | 71 | 53 | - | 63 |
| $H$ | 41 | 55 | 45 | 78 | 68 | 49 | 63 | - |

weight of MST $=31+40+51+43+52+54=271$
lower bound $=$ weight of MST + two edges of least weight from $H$

$$
=271+41+45=357 \mathrm{~km}
$$

5. (a) let $X$ play strategies $X_{1}$ and $X_{2}$ with proportions $p$ and $(1-p)$ expected payoff to $X$ against each of $Y$ 's strategies:
$Y_{1} \quad 10 p-4(1-p)=14 p-4$
$Y_{2} \quad 4 p-(1-p)=5 p-1$
$Y_{3} \quad 3 p+9(1-p)=9-6 p$
giving

$p=0 \quad p=1$
it is not worth player $Y$ considering strategy $Y_{1}$
for optimal strategy $5 p-1=9-6 p$

$$
\therefore 11 p=10, p=\frac{10}{11}
$$

$\therefore X$ should play $X_{1} \frac{10}{11}$ of time and $X_{2} \frac{1}{11}$ of time
(b) let $Y$ play strategies $Y_{2}$ and $Y_{3}$ with proportions $q$ and $(1-q)$
expected loss to $Y$ against each of $X$ 's strategies:
$X_{1} \quad 4 q+3(1-q)=q+3$
$X_{2} \quad-q+9(1-q)=9-10 q$
M1 A1
for optimal strategy $q+3=9-10 q$

$$
\therefore 11 q=6, q=\frac{6}{11}
$$

$\therefore Y$ should not play $Y_{1}$, should play $Y_{2} \frac{6}{11}$ of time and $Y_{3} \frac{5}{11}$ of time M1 A1
(c) value $=\left(5 \times \frac{10}{11}\right)-1=3 \frac{6}{11}$

M1 A1
6. need to maximise so subtract all values from 55 giving

| 18 | 26 | 11 | 4 | 4 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: |
| 10 | 25 | 12 | 14 | 40 |
| 23 | 28 | 16 | 5 | 5 |
| 12 | 30 | 4 | 0 |  |
| 12 | 0 |  |  |  |

reducing rows gives:
142270
$\begin{array}{lll}0 & 15 & 2\end{array}$
1823110
M1 A1
123040
----------.
col min.
$\begin{array}{llll}0 & 15 & 2\end{array}$
reducing columns gives:

| 14 | 7 | 5 | 0 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 |
| 18 | 8 | 9 | 0 |
| 12 | 15 | 2 | 0 |

2 lines required to cover all zeros, apply algorithm B1

| 12 | 5 | 3 | 0 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 6 |
| 16 | 6 | 7 | 0 |
| 10 | 13 | 0 | 0 |

(N.B. a different choice of lines will
lead to the same final assignment)

M1 A1

3 lines required to cover all zeros, apply algorithm


4 lines required to cover all zeros so allocation is possible
M1 A1
$R_{1}$ goes to $A_{2}$
$R_{2}$ goes to $A_{1}$
$R_{3}$ goes to $A_{4}$
$R_{4}$ goes to $A_{3}$
7. (a)

|  | $W_{\mathrm{A}}$ | $W_{\mathrm{B}}$ | $W_{\mathrm{C}}$ | Available |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $W_{1}$ | 5 | 5 |  | 10 |
| $W_{2}$ |  | 7 | 1 | 8 |
| $W_{3}$ |  |  | 7 | 7 |
| Required | 5 | 12 | 8 |  |

taking $R_{1}=0, \quad R_{1}+K_{1}=7 \quad \therefore K_{1}=7 \quad R_{1}+K_{2}=8 \quad \therefore K_{2}=8$
$R_{2}+K_{2}=6 \quad \therefore R_{2}={ }^{-} 2 \quad R_{2}+K_{3}=5 \quad \therefore K_{3}=7$
$R_{3}+K_{3}=7 \quad \therefore R_{3}=0$

|  | $K_{1}=7$ | $K_{2}=8$ | $K_{3}=7$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $R_{1}=0$ | 0 | 0 | 10 |  |
| $R_{2}=-2$ |  | 9 | 0 | 0 |
| $R_{3}=0$ |  | 11 | 0 | 5 |

improvement indices, $I_{i j}=C_{i j}-R_{i}-K_{j}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\therefore \quad & I_{13}=10-0-7=3 \\
I_{21} & =9-(-2)-7=4 \\
& I_{31}=11-0-7=4 \\
& I_{32}=5-0-8=-3
\end{aligned}
$$

(c)
applying algorithm let $\theta=7$, giving

|  | $W_{\mathrm{A}}$ | $W_{\mathrm{B}}$ | $W_{\mathrm{C}}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $W_{1}$ | 5 | 5 |  |
| $W_{2}$ |  | $7-\theta$ | $1+\theta$ |
| $W_{3}$ |  | $\theta$ | $7-\theta$ |


|  | $W_{\mathrm{A}}$ | $W_{\mathrm{B}}$ | $W_{\mathrm{C}}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $W_{1}$ | 5 | 5 |  |
| $W_{2}$ |  |  | 8 |
| $W_{3}$ |  | 7 |  |

no. of rows + no. of cols $-1=3+3-1=5$
in this solution only 4 cells are occupied, less than $5 \therefore$ degenerate
(d) placing 0 in $(2,2)$ so it is occupied
taking $R_{1}=0, \quad R_{1}+K_{1}=7 \quad \therefore K_{1}=$
$R_{1}+K_{2}=8 \quad \therefore K_{2}=8$
$R_{2}+K_{3}=5 \quad \therefore K_{3}=7 \quad$ M1 A1
$R_{2}+K_{2}=6 \quad \therefore R_{2}=-2$
$R_{3}+K_{2}=5 \quad \therefore R_{3}=-3$

|  | $K_{1}=7$ | $K_{2}=8$ | $K_{3}=7$ |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $R_{1}=0$ | 0 | 0 | 10 |  |  |
| $R_{2}=-2$ |  | 9 | 0 | $(0)$ |  |
| $R_{3}=-3$ |  | 11 | 0 | 7 |  |

$$
\begin{aligned}
\therefore \quad I_{13} & =10-0-7=3 \\
I_{21} & =9-(-2)-7=4 \\
I_{31} & =11-(-3)-7=7 \\
I_{33} & =7-(-3)-7=3
\end{aligned}
$$

all improvement indices are non-negative $\therefore$ pattern is optimal
5 lorries from $W_{1}$ to $W_{\mathrm{A}}, 5$ lorries from $W_{1}$ to $W_{\mathrm{B}}$,
8 lorries from $W_{2}$ to $W_{\mathrm{C}}, 7$ lorries from $W_{3}$ to $W_{\mathrm{B}}$
(e) total cost $=10 \times[(5 \times 7)+(5 \times 8)+(8 \times 5)+(7 \times 5)]=£ 1500$

M1 A1

Performance Record - D2 Paper A

| Question no. | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Topic(s) | game, stable <br> soln. | $\begin{aligned} & \text { transport., } \\ & \text { formulate } \\ & \text { lin. prog. } \end{aligned}$ | dynamic prog. min. | TSP, nearest neighbour | $\begin{aligned} & \text { game, } \\ & \text { graphical } \\ & \text { method } \end{aligned}$ | allocation, max. | transport., n-w corner, stepping- stone, degeneracy |  |
| Marks | 5 | 6 | 9 | 11 | 13 | 13 | 18 | 75 |
| Student |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

